

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA  
CHARLOTTE DIVISION  
Case No. 3:18-cv-95**

**RAYMOND BENITEZ,**  
individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

**THE CHARLOTTE MECKLENBURG  
HOSPITAL AUTHORITY, d/b/a  
CAROLINAS HEALTHCARE SYSTEM,  
ATRIUM HEALTH**

Defendant.

**DEFENDANT’S  
MOTION FOR JUDGMENT ON THE  
PLEADINGS  
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(c)**

NOW COMES the Defendant in the above-captioned matter, pursuant to Fed.R.Civ.P. Rule 12(c), and moves for Judgment on the Pleadings dismissing the Complaint. The grounds for this Motion are that: (1) the Plaintiff’s claim for monetary damages are barred by the Local Government Antitrust Act of 1984 (“LGAA”), 15 U.S.C. § 34 *et seq.*, and the “indirect purchaser” rule of *Illinois Brick Co. v. Illinois*, 431 U.S. 720 (1977); and, (2) the Plaintiff’s claim for injunctive relief is barred under concepts of antitrust standing and under the doctrine of duplicative litigation as the relief he seeks is no different than that sought by the United States and North Carolina in *United States v. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Hospital Authority*, No. 3:16cv311 (June 19, 2016) (ECF No. 1) (“Gov’t Compl.”).<sup>1</sup> In further support of this Motion the Defendant relies upon the pleadings in this matter and adopts by reference and incorporates into this

---

<sup>1</sup> In the alternative, the Defendant requests that this Court stay the Plaintiff’s claim for injunctive relief under the duplicative litigation doctrine.

Motion the Second Defense to Claims for Relief Seeking the Recovery of Damages, Interest on Damages, Costs, Attorneys' Fees and Trebling, and its Third Defense to Claims for Relief Seeking the Recovery of Damages, Interest on Damages, Costs, Attorneys' Fees and Trebling.

WHEREFORE, the Defendant prays that this Court:

1. Grant Judgment on the Pleadings in favor of the Defendant and dismiss the Plaintiff's claims for monetary damages;
2. Grant Judgment on the Pleadings in favor of the Defendant and dismiss the Plaintiff's claims for injunctive relief;
3. In the alternative, stay the Plaintiff's claims for injunctive relief pending resolution of *United States v. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Hospital Authority*, No. 3:16cv311.

This 30<sup>th</sup> day of April 2018.

/s/ James P. Cooney

James P. Cooney III (N.C. Bar No. 12140)

Debbie W. Harden (N.C. Bar No. 10576)

Mark J. Horoschak (N.C. Bar No. 22816)

Brian Hayles (N.C. Bar No. 33971)

Sarah Motley Stone (N.C. Bar No. 34117)

Michael Fischer (N.C. Bar No. 47029)

WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP

One Wells Fargo Center, Suite 3500

301 South College Street

Charlotte, North Carolina 28202

Telephone: (704) 331-4900

E-mails: [jim.cooney@wbd-us.com](mailto:jim.cooney@wbd-us.com)

[debbie.harden@wbd-us.com](mailto:debbie.harden@wbd-us.com)

[mark.horoschak@wbd-us.com](mailto:mark.horoschak@wbd-us.com)

[brian.hayles@wbd-us.com](mailto:brian.hayles@wbd-us.com)

[sarah.stone@wbd-us.com](mailto:sarah.stone@wbd-us.com)

[michael.fischer@wbd-us.com](mailto:michael.fischer@wbd-us.com)

Hampton Y. Dellinger (N.C. Bar No. 19903)

Richard A. Feinstein\*

Nicholas A. Widnell\*

J. Wells Harrell\*  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
1401 New York Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20005  
Telephone: (202) 237-2727  
E-mails: [hdellinger@bsfllp.com](mailto:hdellinger@bsfllp.com)  
[rfeinstein@bsfllp.com](mailto:rfeinstein@bsfllp.com)  
[nwidnell@bsfllp.com](mailto:nwidnell@bsfllp.com)  
[wharrell@bsfllp.com](mailto:wharrell@bsfllp.com)

*Attorneys for Defendant The Charlotte-  
Mecklenburg Hospital Authority d/b/a  
Carolinas Healthcare System*

\* Pro Hac Vice Applications Forthcoming

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 30<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2018, the foregoing was served via the Court's CM/ECF system to all parties registered to receive such notice including:

J. Gentry Caudill  
Adam S. Hocutt  
Dozier Miller Law Group  
301 S. McDowell Street, Suite 700  
Charlotte, NC 28204

R. Stephen Berry  
Berry Law PLLC  
1717 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Suite 850  
Washington, DC 20006

Justin M. Ellis  
Lauren M. Weinstein  
Steven F. Molo  
Mololamken LLP  
430 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10022

Thomas J. Wiegand  
Mololamken LLP  
300 N. LaSalle Street, Suite 5350  
Chicago, IL 60654

*Attorneys for Plaintiff and Proposed Class Co-Counsel*

/s/ James P. Cooney  
James P. Cooney III (N.C. Bar No. 12140)